

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03868 0161

**Materials  
on  
LABOUR ARBITRATION  
IN  
CANADA**

**Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**January, 1990  
revised 1993**



BORA LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**Materials**

**on**

**LABOUR ARBITRATION**

**IN**

**CANADA**

Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto

January, 1990  
revised 1993



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/materialsonlabou00unse\\_2](https://archive.org/details/materialsonlabou00unse_2)

## (i)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Topic 1.	The Nature and Contents of the Collective Agreement. . . . .	1
Topic 2.	The Grievance Procedure: Purpose and Machinery. . . . .	9
Topic 3.	After Exhaustion of any Grievance Procedure, Why Not Ultimate Enforcement by Court Action or Strike? . . .	22
Topic 4.	The Legislatures' Choice of Arbitration to Determine Grievances: The Statutory Quid Pro Quo and the Result in Collective Agreements. . . . .	26
Topic 5.	Parties to the Processes of Determining Grievances . . .	32
Topic 6.	The Nature of the Arbitrator's Function: Mediator, Judge, or Labour Relations Policy-maker? . . . . .	39
Topic 7.	The Significance of the Parties' Past in Arbitral Reasoning . . . . .	43
A.	Significance of the Parties' Past in Interpreting Written Terms of the Agreement . . . . .	43
B.	Significance of the Parties' Past in Barring Enforcement of Written Terms of the Agreement. . . . .	51
C.	Significance of the Parties' Past in Creating Enforceable Unwritten Terms of the Agreement . . . . .	57
Topic 8.	The Significance of the General Law in Arbitral Reasoning. . . . .	71
A.	Statute Law. . . . .	71
B.	Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms. . . . .	79
C.	Judge-Made Law . . . . .	88
Topic 9.	The Significance of the Employer's "Unfair" or "Discriminatory" Conduct in Arbitral Reasoning. . . . .	93
Topic 10.	The Significance of Previous Awards in Arbitral Reasoning . . . . .	102
A.	Different Parties, Different Provisions, Same Issue . . . . .	102
B.	Same Parties, Same Provisions, Same Issue. . . . .	104

Topic 11.	Remedial Power of Arbitrators . . . . .	106
A.	Remedial Power After Determining Breach of Collective Agreement . . . . .	106
B.	Power to Rectify Collective Agreement Before Determining Breach . . . . .	111
Topic 12.	Labour Arbitration Procedures . . . . .	118
A.	An Overview . . . . .	118
B.	Sole Arbitrator or Tripartite Board? . . . . .	119
C.	Choosing the Sole Arbitrator or Board Members . . . . .	120
D.	Conduct of the Hearing . . . . .	126
E.	Evidence Problems at the Hearing . . . . .	138
F.	Argument . . . . .	146
G.	Considering, Drafting and Issuing the Award . . . . .	146
H.	Criticisms of the Process, and Legislatures' Responses . . . . .	150
Topic 13.	Discovery Procedures . . . . .	160
Topic 14.	Procedural Defects Denying Arbitrability: Preliminary Objections . . . . .	160
A.	The Arbitrator's Power of Determination. . . . .	160
B.	The Formal Grievance Documents as Defining the Arbitrable Issue . . . . .	160
C.	Individual v. Union or Employer Grievances . . . . .	166
D.	Timeliness . . . . .	177
E.	Grievor No Longer Wishes to Proceed. . . . .	192
F.	One Hearing or Two?. . . . .	199
Topic 15.	The End of Arbitral Authority: "Functus Officio" . . . . .	202
Topic 16.	Seniority. . . . .	206
A.	Introduction . . . . .	206
B.	Application of Seniority . . . . .	209

(iii)

C.	Accumulation of Seniority . . . . .	214
D.	Termination of Seniority. . . . .	220
E.	Promotion and Layoff Out of Seniority: Problems of Arbitral Review . . . . .	225
Topic 17.	Management's Rights and Industrial Change. . . . .	243
A.	Introduction . . . . .	243
B.	Subcontracting . . . . .	246
C.	Work Assignment. . . . .	255
D.	Compulsory Retirement. . . . .	264
E.	Other Issues . . . . .	276
Topic 18.	Disciplinary and Non-Disciplinary Responses of Employer to Employee's Conduct . . . . .	276
A.	The Spectrum of the Employer's Possible Responses. . . . .	276
B.	Theories of Disciplinary Responses . . . . .	296
C.	Some Examples of Occasions for Discipline. . . . .	298
D.	Due Process Limitations on Discipline . . . . .	313
E.	Arbitral Authority to Review the Employer's Response . . . . .	320
F.	Arbitral Authority to Modify the Employer's Response . . . . .	324
G.	Arbitral Standards for Assessing Propriety of the Employer's Response . . . . .	325
Topic 19.	Judicial Intervention in the Labour Arbitration Process . . . . .	357
A.	Judicial Enforcement of the Award . . . . .	357
B.	Judicial Review of the Award . . . . .	359

